Report of the auditor-general to North West Provincial Legislature and the council on Moses Kotane Local Municipality

Report on the audit of the financial statements

Qualified opinion

1. I have audited the financial statements of the Moses Kotane Local Municipality set out on pages xx to xx, which comprise the statement of financial position as at 30 June 2023, statement of financial performance, statement of changes in net assets, cash flow statement and statement of comparison of budget information with actual information for the year then ended, as well as notes to the financial statements, including a summary of significant accounting policies.

2. In my opinion, except for the possible effects of the matters described in the basis for qualified opinion section of this auditor's report, the financial statements present fairly, in all material respects, the financial position of the Moses Kotane Local Municipality as at 30 June 2023, and financial performance and cash flows for the year then ended in accordance with the Standards of Generally Recognised Accounting Practice (GRAP) and the requirements of the Municipal Finance Management Act 56 of 2003 (MFMA) and the Division of Revenue Act 5 of 2022 (DoRA)

Basis for qualified opinion

General expense

3. I was unable to obtain sufficient appropriate audit evidence that fuel and oil for the current year occurred, due to the status of the accounting records. I was unable to confirm these fuel and oil transactions by alternative means. Consequently, I was unable to determine whether any adjustments were necessary to fuel and oil expenses of R21 473 131, included in general expenses of R213 393 678 disclosed in note 33 to the financial statements.

Context for opinion

4. I conducted my audit in accordance with the International Standards on Auditing (ISAs). My responsibilities under those standards are further described in the responsibilities of the auditor-general for the audit of the financial statements section of my report.

5. I am independent of the municipality in accordance with the International Ethics Standards Board for Accountants' *International code of ethics for professional accountants (including International Independence Standards)* (IESBA code) as well as other ethical requirements that are relevant to my audit in South Africa. I have fulfilled my other ethical responsibilities in accordance with these requirements and the IESBA code.

6. I believe that the audit evidence I have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for my qualified opinion.

Emphasis of matter

7. I draw attention to the matters below. My opinion is not modified in respect of these matters.

Unauthorised, Irregular and Fruitless and wasteful Expenditure

8. As disclosed in note 43 to the financial statements, unauthorised expenditure of R9 119 548 was incurred in the current year and the unauthorised expenditure of R432 098 829 in respect of prior years have not yet been dealt with in accordance with section 32 of the MFMA.

9. As disclosed in note 45 to the financial statements, irregular expenditure of R77 310 514 was incurred in the current year and irregular expenditure of R1 473 035 971 from prior years have not yet been dealt with in accordance with section 32 of the MFMA.

10. As disclosed in note 44 to the financial statements, fruitless and wasteful expenditure of R2 794 144 was incurred in the current year and fruitless and wasteful expenditure of R131 116 581 from prior years have not yet been dealt with in accordance with section 32 of the MFMA.

Material losses

11. As disclosed in note 31 to the financial statements, the municipality incurred water losses of R17 869 356.

Restatement of corresponding figures

12. As disclosed in note 40 to the financial statements, the corresponding figures for 30 June 2022 were restated as a result of an error in the financial statements of the municipality for the year ended 30 June 2023.

Other matters

13. I draw attention to the matters below. My opinion is not modified in respect of these matters.

Unaudited disclosure notes

14. In terms of section 125(2)(e) of the MFMA, the municipality is required to disclose particulars of non-compliance with the MFMA. This disclosure requirement did not form part of the audit of the financial statements and accordingly I do not express an opinion thereon.

Responsibilities of the accounting officer for the financial statements

15. The accounting officer is responsible for the preparation and fair presentation of the financial statements in accordance with the Standards of GRAP and the requirements of the MFMA and the DoRA and for such internal control as the accounting officer determines is necessary to enable the preparation of financial statements that are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error.

16. In preparing the financial statements, the accounting officer is responsible for assessing the municipality's ability to continue as a going concern; disclosing, as applicable, matters relating to

going concern; and using the going concern basis of accounting unless the appropriate governance structure either intends to liquidate the municipality or to cease operations, or has no realistic alternative but to do so.

Responsibilities of the auditor-general for the audit of the financial statements

17. My objectives are to obtain reasonable assurance about whether the financial statements as a whole are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error; and to issue an auditor's report that includes my opinion. Reasonable assurance is a high level of assurance but is not a guarantee that an audit conducted in accordance with the ISAs will always detect a material misstatement when it exists. Misstatements can arise from fraud or error and are considered material if, individually or in aggregate, they could reasonably be expected to influence the economic decisions of users taken on the basis of these financial statements.

18. A further description of my responsibilities for the audit of the financial statements is included in the annexure to this auditor's report.

19. I am independent of the municipality in accordance with the International Ethics Standards Board for Accountants' International code of ethics for professional accountants (including International Independence Standards) (IESBA code), as well as the other ethical requirements that are relevant to my audit in South Africa. I have fulfilled my other ethical responsibilities in accordance with these requirements and the IESBA code.

Report on the audit of the annual performance report

20. In accordance with the Public Audit Act 25 of 2004 (PAA) and the general notice issued in terms thereof, I must audit and report on the usefulness and reliability of the reported performance against predetermined objectives for the selected key performance area presented in the annual performance report. The accounting officer is responsible for the preparation of the annual performance report.

21. I selected the following key performance area presented in the annual performance report for the year ended 30 June 2023 for auditing. I selected a key performance area that measures the municipality's performance on its primary mandated functions and that is of significant national, community or public interest.

Key performance area	Page numbers	Purpose.
Key Performance Area 1: Basic service delivery and infrastructure development	[XX]	To accelerate the provision of basic services

22. I evaluated the reported performance information for the selected key performance area against the criteria developed from the performance management and reporting framework, as defined in the general notice. When an annual performance report is prepared using these criteria, it provides useful and reliable information and insights to users on the municipality's planning and delivery on its mandate and objectives.

23. I performed procedures to test whether:

- the indicators used for planning and reporting on performance can be linked directly to the municipality's mandate and the achievement of its planned objectives
- the indicators are well defined to ensure that they are easy to understand and can be applied consistently, as well as verifiable so that I can confirm the methods and processes to be used for measuring achievements
- the targets can be linked directly to the achievement of the indicators and are specific, time bound and measurable to ensure that it is easy to understand what should be delivered and by when, the required level of performance as well as how performance will be evaluated
- the indicators and targets reported on in the annual performance report are the same as those committed to in the approved initial or revised planning documents
- the reported performance information is presented in the annual performance report in the prescribed manner
- there is adequate supporting evidence for the achievements reported and for the measures taken to improve performance .

24. I performed the procedures for the purpose of reporting material findings only; and not to express an assurance opinion or conclusion.

25. The material findings on the reported performance information for the selected key performance area are as follows:

Basic service delivery and infrastructure development

Various indicators

26. I was unable to obtain sufficient appropriate audit evidence that clearly defined the predetermined source information and method of collection or that related systems and processes were established to enable consistent measurement and reliable reporting of the actual achievement of the indicators listed below. This was due to a lack of measurement definitions and processes. I was unable to confirm that the indicators are well defined and verifiable by alternative means. As a result, I was unable to audit the reliability of the achievements reported in the annual performance report of the listed indicators.

Indicator Number	**Indicator description**	**Target**	**Reported achievement**
KPI 16	% of households with access to water	100%	100%
KPI 17	% of villages with access to water	100%	0%
KPI 43	% of households provided with access to solid waste removal (Madikwe & Mogwase)	100%	0%

Various indicators

27. The reasons for under achievements reported against planned targets in the annual performance report were not explained for the following indicators:

- % of villages with access to water
- % of households provided with access to solid waste removal(Madikwe & Mogwase)

Various indicators

28. I could not determine if the reasons for the differences between the reported achievements against the planned targets were correct, as adequate supporting evidence was not provided for auditing. Consequently, I could not confirm the reliability of the reasons for the reported under achievements.

Indicator Number	Indicator description	Target	Reported achievement
KPI 14	% of Magong Water Augmentation constructed by 30 June 2023	100%	0%
KPI 41	% of Mogwase Sports facility (Phase III) upgraded	100%	96%

KPI 43 - % of households provided with access to solid waste removal (Madikwe & Mogwase)

29. The indicator was included in the approved service delivery and budget implementation plan and integrated development plan but then not clearly defined during planning processes. It was also not determined how the related target would be measured and what evidence would be needed to support the achievement. Consequently, the information might be less useful for measuring performance.

Other matters

30. I draw attention to the matters below.

Achievement of planned targets

31. The annual performance report includes information on reported achievements against planned targets and provides explanations for under achievements and measures taken to improve performance. This information should be considered in the context of the material findings on the reported performance information.

Material misstatements

32. I identified material misstatements in the annual performance report submitted for auditing. These material misstatements were in the reported performance information for basic service delivery and infrastructure development. Management did not correct the misstatements and I reported material findings in this regard.

Report on compliance with legislation

33. In accordance with the PAA and the general notice issued in terms thereof, I must audit and report on compliance with applicable legislation relating to financial matters, financial management and other related matters. The accounting officer is responsible for the municipality's compliance with legislation.

34. I performed procedures to test compliance with selected requirements in key legislation in accordance with the findings engagement methodology of the Auditor-General of South Africa (AGSA). This engagement is not an assurance engagement. Accordingly, I do not express an assurance opinion or conclusion.

35. Through an established AGSA process, I selected requirements in key legislation for compliance testing that are relevant to the financial and performance management of the municipality, clear to allow consistent measurement and evaluation, while also sufficiently detailed and readily available to report in an understandable manner. The selected legislative requirements are included in the annexure to this auditor's report.

36. The material findings on compliance with the selected legislative requirements, presented per compliance theme, are as follows:

Annual financial statements, performance and annual reports

37. The financial statements submitted for auditing were not prepared in all material respects in accordance with the requirements of section 122(1) of the MFMA. Material misstatements of consumer debtors, payables from exchange transactions and irregular expenditure identified by the auditors in the submitted financial statements were subsequently corrected, but the supporting records that could not be provided resulted in the financial statements receiving a qualified audit opinion.

38. The oversight report adopted by the council on the 2021/22 annual report was not made public, as required by section 129(3) of the MFMA.

HR management

39. Appropriate systems and procedures to monitor, measure and evaluate performance of staff were not developed and adopted, as required by section 67(1)(d) of the MSA.

Expenditure management

40. Reasonable steps were not taken to prevent irregular expenditure amounting to R77 310 514 as disclosed in note 45 to the annual financial statements, as required by section 62(1)(d) of the MFMA. The majority of the irregular expenditure was caused by deviations which are not in line with legislation.

41. Reasonable steps were not taken to prevent fruitless and wasteful expenditure amounting to R2 794 144, as disclosed in note xx to the annual financial statements, in contravention of section 62(1)(d) of the MFMA. The majority of the disclosed fruitless and wasteful expenditure was caused by penalties charged on late payments.

42. Reasonable steps were not taken to prevent unauthorised expenditure amounting to R9 119 548, as disclosed in note 43 to the annual financial statements, in contravention of section 62(1)(d) of the MFMA. The majority of the unauthorised expenditure was caused by overspending on certain votes within the budget.

Asset management

43. Capital assets were disposed of without the municipal council having, in a meeting open to the public, decided on whether the assets were still needed to provide the minimum level of basic municipal services, as required by section 14(2)(a) of the MFMA.

Consequence management

44. Unauthorised, irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure incurred by the municipality was not investigated to determine if any person is liable for the expenditure, as required by section 32(2)(a) and (b) of the MFMA.

Procurement and contract management

45. Some of the goods and services of a transaction value above R200 000 were procured without inviting competitive bids, as required by SCM Regulation 19(a). Deviations were approved by the accounting officer even though it was not impractical to invite competitive bids, in contravention of SCM Regulation 36(1).

Other information in the annual report

46. The accounting officer is responsible for the other information included in the annual report, which includes the audit committee's report. The other information referred to does not include the financial statements, the auditor's report and those selected key performance area presented in the annual performance report that have been specifically reported on in this auditor's report.

47. My opinion on the financial statements, the report on the audit of the annual performance report and the report on compliance with legislation do not cover the other information included in the annual report and I do not express an audit opinion or any form of assurance conclusion on it.

48. My responsibility is to read this other information and, in doing so, consider whether it is materially inconsistent with the financial statements and the selected key performance area presented in the annual performance report or my knowledge obtained in the audit, or otherwise appears to be materially misstated.

49. I did not receive the other information prior to the date of this auditor's report. After I receive and read this information, and if I conclude that there is a material misstatement, I am required to communicate the matter to those charged with governance and request that the other information be corrected. If the other information is not corrected, I may have to retract this auditor's report and re-issue an amended report as appropriate. However, if it is corrected this will not be necessary.

Internal control deficiencies

50. I considered internal control relevant to my audit of the financial statements, annual performance report and compliance with applicable legislation; however, my objective was not to express any form of assurance on it.

51. The matters reported below are limited to the significant internal control deficiencies that resulted in the basis for the qualified opinion, the material findings on the annual performance report and the material findings on compliance with legislation included in this report.

52. The accounting officer did not develop and implement a records management system and internal controls to ensure that accurate records are kept, which resulted in the material limitation.

53. The accounting officer did not monitor compliance with laws and regulations during the year line with the prior year action plan resulting in repeat findings being reported in the current year.

54. The availability of information to support the reported performance information continues to be a challenge due to quarterly/regular reconciliations reported targets not being performed by management.

55. Unauthorised, irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure incurred by the municipality was not investigated due to delayed implementation of recommendations to capacitate MPAC.

Auditor General

Rustenburg

30 November 2023

AUDITOR-GENERAL
SOUTH AFRICA

Auditing to build public confidence

Annexure to the auditor’s report

The annexure includes the following:

- The auditor-general’s responsibility for the audit
- The selected legislative requirements for compliance testing

Auditor-general’s responsibility for the audit

Professional judgement and professional scepticism

As part of an audit in accordance with the ISAs, I exercise professional judgement and maintain professional scepticism throughout my audit of the financial statements and the procedures performed on reported performance information for selected key performance area and on the municipality’s compliance with selected requirements in key legislation.

Financial statements

In addition to my responsibility for the audit of the financial statements as described in this auditor’s report, I also:

- identify and assess the risks of material misstatement of the financial statements, whether due to fraud or error; design and perform audit procedures responsive to those risks; and obtain audit evidence that is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for my opinion. The risk of not detecting a material misstatement resulting from fraud is higher than for one resulting from error, as fraud may involve collusion, forgery, intentional omissions, misrepresentations or the override of internal control
- obtain an understanding of internal control relevant to the audit in order to design audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of the municipality’s internal control
- evaluate the appropriateness of accounting policies used and the reasonableness of accounting estimates and related disclosures made
- conclude on the appropriateness of the use of the going concern basis of accounting in the preparation of the financial statements. I also conclude, based on the audit evidence obtained, whether a material uncertainty exists relating to events or conditions that may cast significant doubt on the ability of the municipality to continue as a going concern. If I conclude that a material uncertainty exists, I am required to draw attention in my auditor’s report to the related disclosures in the financial statements about the material uncertainty or, if such disclosures are inadequate, to modify my opinion on the financial statements. My conclusions are based on the information available to me at the date of this auditor’s report. However, future events or conditions may cause a municipality to cease operating as a going concern
- evaluate the overall presentation, structure and content of the financial statements, including the disclosures, and determine whether the financial statements represent the underlying transactions and events in a manner that achieves fair presentation.

Communication with those charged with governance

I communicate with the accounting officer regarding, among other matters, the planned scope and timing of the audit and significant audit findings, including any significant deficiencies in internal control that I identify during my audit.

I also provide the accounting officer with a statement that I have complied with relevant ethical requirements regarding independence and communicate with them all relationships and other matters that may reasonably be thought to bear on my independence and, where applicable, actions taken to eliminate threats or safeguards applied.

Compliance with legislation – selected legislative requirements

The selected legislative requirements are as follows:

Legislation	Sections or regulations
Municipal Finance Management Act 56 of 2003	Section 1 - Paragraph (a), (b) & (d) of the definition: irregular expenditure, Section 1 - Definition: service delivery and budget implementation plan, Sections 11(1), 13(2), 14(1), 14(2)(a), 14(2)(b), 15, 24(2)(c)(iv), 29(1), Sections 29(2)(b), 32(2), 32(2)(a), 32(2)(a)(i), 32(2)(a)(ii), 32(2)(b), Sections 32(6)(a), 32(7), 53(1)(c)(ii), 54(1)(c), 62(1)(d), 62(1)(f)(i), Sections 62(1)(f)(ii), 62(1)(f)(iii), 63(1)(a), 63(2)(a), 63(2)(c), 64(2)(b), Sections 64(2)(c), 64(2)(e), 64(2)(f), 64(2)(g), 65(2)(a), 65(2)(b), 65(2)(e), Sections 72(1)(a)(ii), 112(1)(j), 116(2)(b), 116(2)(c)(ii), 117, 122(1), Sections 122(2), 126(1)(a), 126(1)(b), 127(2), 127(5)(a)(i), 127(5)(a)(ii), Sections 129(1), 129(3), 133(1)(a), 133(1)(c)(i), 133(1)(c)(ii), 170, Sections 171(4)(a), 171(4)(b)
MFMA: Municipal Budget and Reporting Regulations, 2009	Regulations 71(1), 71(2), 72
MFMA: Municipal Investment Regulations, 2005	Regulations 3(1)(a), 3(3), 6, 7, 12(2), 12(3)
MFMA: Municipal Regulations on Financial Misconduct Procedures and Criminal Proceedings, 2014	Regulations 5(4), 6(8)(a), 6(8)(b), 10(1)
MFMA: Municipal Supply Chain Management Regulations, 2017	Regulations 5, 12(1)(c), 12(3), 13(b), 13(c), 13(c)(i), 16(a), 17(1)(a), Regulations 17(1)(b), 17(1)(c), 19(a), 21(b), 22(1)(b)(i), 22(2), 27(2)(a), Regulations 27(2)(e), 28(1)(a)(i), 28(1)(a)(ii), 29(1)(a), 29(1)(b), Regulations 29(5)(a)(ii), 29(5)(b)(ii), 32, 36(1), 36(1)(a), 38(1)(c), Regulations 38(1)(d)(ii), 38(1)(e), 38(1)(g)(i), 38(1)(g)(ii), 38(1)(g)(iii), 43, Regulations 44, 46(2)(e), 46(2)(f)
Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000	Sections 25(1), 26(a), 26(c), 26(h), 26(i), 29(1)(b)(ii), 29(3)(b), 34(a), 34(b), Sections 38(a), 41(1)(a), 41(1)(b), 41(1)(c)(ii), 42, 43(2), 56(a), 57(2)(a), Sections 57(4B), 57(6)(a), 66(1)(a), 66(1)(b), 67(1)(d), 74(1), 93J(1), 96(b) **Parent municipality with ME:** Sections 93B(a), 93B(b)

Legislation	Sections or regulations
	Parent municipality with shared control of ME: Sections 93C(a)(iv), 93C(a)(v)
MSA: Municipal Planning and performance Management Regulations, 2001	Regulations 2(1)(e), 2(3)(a), 3(3), 3(4)(b), 3(6)(a), 7(1), 8, 9(1)(a), 10(a), Regulations 12(1), 15(1)(a)(i), 15(1)(a)(ii)
MSA: Municipal Performance Regulations for Municipal Managers and Managers directly Accountable to Municipal Managers, 2006	Regulations 2(3)(a), 4(4)(b), 8(1), 8(2), 8(3)
MSA: Regulations on Appointment and Conditions of Employment of Senior Managers, 2014	Regulations 17(2), 36(1)(a)
MSA: Disciplinary Regulations for Senior Managers, 2011	Regulations 5(2), 5(3), 5(6), 8(4)
Annual Division of Revenue Act	Section 11(6)(b), 12(5), 16(1); 16(3)
Construction Industry Development Board Act 38 of 2000	Section 18(1)
Construction Industry Development Board Regulations	Regulations 17, 25(7A)
Municipal Property Rates Act 6 of 2004	Section 3(1)
Preferential Procurement Policy Framework Act 5 of 2000	Sections 2(1)(a), 2(1)(f)
Preferential Procurement Regulations, 2017	Regulations 4(1), 4(2), 5(1), 5(3), 5(6), 5(7), 6(1), 6(2), 6(3), 6(6), 6(8), Regulations 7(1), 7(2), 7(3), 7(6), 7(8), 8(2), 8(5) 9(1), 10(1), 10(2), Regulations 11(1), 11(2)
Preferential Procurement Regulations, 2022	Regulations 4(1), 4(2), 4(3), 4(4), 5(1), 5(2), 5(3), 5(4)